Morgan Roggenbaum, Quinn Vollmer, Emily Briselli, Louis Waryanka, Bethany Rutledge

History of a Public Controversy:

Should NCAA Athletes be paid?

Script & Citations

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Audio | Visuals |
| Game audio fades in... | Title: Division 1 Athletics, The Debate Over NCAA Athlete Compensation |
| That is Rick Pitino. As head coach for the Louisville Men’s Basketball team in 2017, he was paid nearly $7.8 million dollars. | Kentucky v. Louisville, Men’s BasketballRick Pitino Picture |
| Nick Saban, head coach of the University of Alabama’s Football team, had a salary of over $11.1 million this year. | Clemson v. Alabama, 2016 National Championship |
| This is Mark Emmert, the President of the NCAA. The nonprofit’s latest tax return shows that he was compensated with over $1.9 million dollars in 2015.  | Mark Emmert Interview |
| With the NCAA generating just shy of a billion dollars in revenue in 2016, there is plenty of money to go around. | Stanford v Texas NCAA 2016 ChampionshipMidwest Regional Hockey FinalRolling number to $995.9M |
| And to keep their non-profit status, the NCAA and American universities spend *all* of it. On salaries… on luxurious training facilities… massive stadiums - but also sports sponsorships, scholarship funds, grants, education programs - things, the NCAA insists, that student-athletes need. | Kentucky Weight Room & Theater ClipKyle Field Texas A&MNCAA Commercial |
| But, many collegiate athlete’s needs are not being met - despite their tireless work. | Shabazz Napier InterviewRichard Sherman interview |
| So, should college athletes be further compensated for their efforts?This debate is not a new one and the arguments surrounding it have evolved with collegiate athletics. | Black Screen with Text |
| Taylor Branch speaking about collegiate athletics history. | Vox Interview |
| Before 1948, college athletes were paid for their participation in athletics | 1950 Fiesta Bowl Footage |
| The NCAA’s primary purpose was to organize athletic events and plan tournaments. | Boston College Football Championship Picture |
| During this time, the NCAA gained more influence over college athletics. | 1961 AAU Championship Swimming |
| The association adopted a Sanity Code that outruled the compensation of student athletes in any form.  | Western Michigan University Tennis 1950 |
| Universities responded with hostility and threatened to leave the NCAA after the regulation was established. | 1950 Fiesta Bowl Footage |
| The NCAA in turn established a long-lasting policy that allowed for the compensation of college athletes only through tuition coverage, stipends, and fees. | Georgetown v. Villanova Basketball 1985 |
| Following this issue, in 1953, Ernest Nemeth, a football player from the University of Denver, sought further compensation after getting injured on the field. The Colorado Supreme Court recognized Nemeth as an “employee” within state workers’ compensation laws. In response, the NCAA crafted the term “student-athlete.” | Women’s GymnasticsUniversity of Denver LogoColorado Supreme Court BuildingNCAA Building |
| This term implies amateurism and is the basis of the NCAA’s argument against the payment of Division 1 college athletes. Without indicated professionalism, these players are considered students first and, therefore, are not entitled to compensation. | Student-Athlete AgreementPenn State GraduationPenn State Volleyball Picture |
| If student-athletes were paid it may ruin their love for the game that Mark Emmert says athlete’s come to know while playing sports as amateurs. | Mark Emmert Clip |
| According to the NCAA, “maintaining amateurism is crucial to preserving an academic environment in which acquiring a quality education is the first priority.” | Highlighted Image of NCAA Website |
| The manual states that the time required of student-athletes for participation in intercollegiateathletics shall be regulated to minimize interference with their academic pursuits. | Highlighted Image of NCAA Division I Manual |
| Although the NCAA claims to emphasize academics, on the university level, athletes are often held to lower academic standards and not given adequate time to focus on their education. In some cases, Universities have even artificially inflated their athlete’s GPAs to ensure they remain academically eligible under NCAA rules. | Nnamdi Amilo StudyingGPA Paper Class Change ClipPaper Class News ClipHBO Sports Interviews |
| We talked to Michaela Putnicki, a freshman at Penn State and a member of the Women’s Volleyball team. She discussed Penn State’s attitude towards student-athletes balancing their academic and extracurricular responsibilities.“Based off of the classes, they try to emphasize that you are a student not an athlete, but I feel like sometimes you have to perform to a certain level and you have to put in extra work, and sometimes you don’t have time to complete academic work or study as much as you need to” | Penn State Volleyball ClipVolleyball Interview |
| To support academic achievement, the NCAA officially limits in-season practice time to 20 hours/week. However, Division 1 universities do not always abide by this restriction. | ASU Swimming PracticeStanford Rowing |
| The time commitment of a Division 1 sport has been compared to that of a full time job. In some cases, student athletes may devote in excess of 40 hours per week to their sport. | Kansas Basketball PlayerMedical Research PictureASU Swimming Practice |
| “Volleyball requires probably 30-35 hours a week, and I have lifting 2 times in the morning in season (for like an hour each morning), and then practice for 3 hours a day for 6 days a week, and then games and competitions take probably 4-5 hours out of my day” | Volleyball InterviewPenn State Football Practice |
| Although student-athletes put in the equivalent amount of work as that of a legitimate occupation, these players are still considered amateur. In order to play on the collegiate level, prospective student-athletes must sign an official agreement to adhere to NCAA amateurism requirements. | Lacrosse practiceWake Forest Soccer PracticeSigning letter of intentBHS Contract Signing |
| Under these conditions, the personal lives of athletes are heavily restricted. Student athletes are not permitted to profit from their experiences in college sports, despite the massive revenue generated for the NCAA by the athletes involved.  | Letter of Intent SigningNCAA logo w/ money |
| Not only can these athletes not sell their signatures or name in any form, they are also prohibited from mentioning their participation in collegiate athletics in any other facet of life if it will turn them a profit. | Baseball VideoJohnny Manziel picture |
| And the NCAA’s personal restrictions go even further to penalize athletes who receive anything on the basis of their participation in collegiate sports. | Athlete Signing AutographClip of Dan Patrick |
| The NCAA requires that student-athletes be treated the same as any other student yet these individuals are not typical students. They put in endless hours of work and generate millions of dollars for the NCAA and universities but do not profit from any of their efforts. | Students walking on campusBroke Student Athlete picture |
| “In some sports, particularly in men's basketball and football, the revenue generated is enormous and it includes not only the tickets and tv rights fees, but also merchandise. In those sports particularly, I think it’s fair to say, when coaches are getting millions and millions of dollars, shouldn’t players share in that bounty?” | Doug Allen Interview |
| The system is warped to benefit the enterprise instead of the players who fuel the operation. Those on either side of the argument recognize the systematic flaws of the NCAA. | NCAA Logo on Basketball CourtOfficial NCAA Building |
| “My solution to the problem, that I’d advocated to the Knight Commission and to other people interested in this is to have a system that allows student athletes to be rewarded for the use of their name and image in producing merchandise, things like jerseys or trading cards or video games, and to do it in a way that’s modeled on pro sports in this country” | Doug Allen Interview |
| Another proposed solution suggests allowing students to earn income that is held in a trust fund. Student-athletes can collect this money if and only if they successfully graduate from their school. This incentivizes students to focus on and complete their education while still being compensated for their participation in athletics.  | Wake Forest Soccer PracticeGraduation ClipASU Workout Wednesday |
| Such a system would be very difficult to implement due to the varying talent and revenue generated among the athletes in the NCAA. Deciding how much money is paid to which players would be a difficult task, complicated by ethical concerns and laws like Title IX - which prohibits discrimination in college sports on the basis of sex. | Athlete StudyingSaquon Barkley touchdownBucknell Women’s Water Polo |
| For now, the system remains consistent in its money hungry and controlling nature. This month, the NCAA imposed a bowl game ban and scholarship restrictions on the University of Mississippi in response to allegations that players received merchandise, food, and transportation based on their affiliation with Ole Miss football. | Maryland Football Team & CoachOle Miss StadiumOle Miss Football game |
| Scandals like this are not uncommon in the NCAA. Although schools are often caught trying to compensate players and entice recruits “under the table,” the NCAA remains opposed to change.The question remains: When will these student-athletes be properly compensated for their efforts? | Time Magazine CoverBlack Screen with Text |

Citations

Research

Academy, U.S. Sports. “Point/Counterpoint: Paying College Athletes.” *The Sport Journal*, 31 Jan. 2015, thesportjournal.org/article/pointcounterpoint-paying-college-athletes/.

Godfrey, Steven, et al. “Ole Miss Sanctions: Extra Bowl Ban, Scholarship Cuts, and More.”*SBNation.com*, SBNation.com, 1 Dec. 2017, www.sbnation.com/college-football/2017/12/1/16512428/ole-miss-ncaa-sanctions-penalties-investigation.

Jcoram. “Amateurism.” *NCAA.org - The Official Site of the NCAA*, 24 Apr. 2014, www.ncaa.org/amateurism.

Jcoram. “Revenue.” *NCAA.org - The Official Site of the NCAA*, 22 Nov. 2013, www.ncaa.org/about/resources/finances/revenue.

McCormick, Robert A, and Amy C McCormick. “The Myth of the Student-Athlete: The College Athlete as Employee.” *Washington Law Review*, vol. 81, no. 71, 2006.

NCAA Academic and Membership Affairs Staff. “Division I Manual.” Indiana, Indianapolis, 1 Aug. 2015.

“Report: 3,100 Students Took Fake Classes.” *YouTube*, CNN, 23 Oct. 2014, www.youtube.com/watch?v=4xWwr4w2zf0&t=141s.

Schlabach, Mark. “Ole Miss Football Self-Imposes One-Year Postseason Ban for 2017.”*ESPN*, ESPN Internet Ventures, 23 Feb. 2017, www.espn.com/college-football/story/\_/id/18743461/ole-miss-rebels-self-impose-1-year-postseason-ban-2017.

“USA TODAY Sports.” *USA Today*, Gannett Satellite Information Network, sports.usatoday.com/ncaa/salaries/mens-basketball/coach/.

“USA TODAY Sports.” *USA Today*, Gannett Satellite Information Network, sports.usatoday.com/ncaa/salaries/.

Media

(In order of appearance)

Kentucky v. Louisville, Men’s Basketball, 21 Dec 2016.

<https://youtu.be/KuNr_ReXpnY>

Rick Pitino Image

<https://nbccollegebasketballtalk.files.wordpress.com/2016/12/628959064-e1482267465232.jpg?w=280&h=158&crop=1>

Clemson v. Alabama 2017 Football Championship <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=to42zfCQNtc>

Mark Emmert Intro Clip

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=67fC7o4t_kY>

Stanford v Texas NCAA 2016 Championship

<https://youtu.be/QRNN6DSNdUc>

Midwest Regional Hockey Final

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JIQX7j1upK0&t=1515s>

Kentucky Weightroom Pan, Theater Vid

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KDrBhKOCDiY&t=84s>

Kyle Field Texas A&M

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y0_s9Hd26tY>

NCAA Commercial

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6ltaRIJ0N2o>

Shabazz Napier Interview

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fFdRk2DYolM&t=3s>

Richard Sherman Interview

<https://youtu.be/eP0FYeO1N2A>

Taylor Branch Vox Interview

<https://www.vox.com/2014/6/9/5793156/the-ncaa-is-on-trial-today-and-this-civil-rights-historian-is-on>

1950 Fiesta Bowl Footage

<https://youtu.be/wwG3qDGksfk>

Boston College Football Champs

<http://www.bceagles.com/news/2015/11/10/FB_1110153607.aspx>

1961 AAU Championship Swimming

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eRsHNfivGRY>

Western Michigan University Tennis 1950

<http://www.wmubroncos.com/sports/2012/9/8/205681673.aspx>

Georgetown v. Villanova Basketball 1985

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IcQx40atibU>

Women’s Gymnastics

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XOJEySBaJFE>

University of Denver Logo

<https://thelawlorgroup.com/>

Colorado Supreme Court Building

<http://www.cpr.org/sites/default/files/images/cosupco.jpg>

NCAA Building

<https://cdn-s3.si.com/s3fs-public/styles/marquee_large_2x/public/images/NCAALogo_FinalFour_960.jpg?itok=rMAMdCO0>

Student-Athlete Agreement

<https://www.ncaa.org/sites/default/files/2017DICOMP_Form171aStudentAthleteStatement_20170613.pdf>

Penn State Graduation

<http://news.psu.edu/sites/default/files/styles/threshold-992/public/4952444158.jpg?itok=5qzaSYTh>

Penn State Volleyball Picture

<http://i.turner.ncaa.com/sites/default/files/styles/640x360/public/media/psu_0.jpeg?itok=y7bC1fkI>

John Oliver NCAA Clip

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pX8BXH3SJn0>

NCAA website

[www.NCAA.org/amateurism](http://www.ncaa.org/amateurism)

NCAA Manual

<http://ulm_ftp.sidearmsports.com/custompages/pdf9/4094906.pdf>

Nnamdi Amilo Studying

<https://uconn-today-universityofconn.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/01/Nnamdi-Amilo160126a004-e1453842781366.jpg>

GPA Paper Class Change

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pX8BXH3SJn0>

Paper Classes News Clip

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4xWwr4w2zf0&t=141s>

HBO Sports Interviews

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=k0-aiUsMn5I>

Penn State Volleyball Clip

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pQDCjV7zgVI&t=72s>

Arizona State University Swimming Practice

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-hIvEo_l84g>

Stanford Rowing

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mabSR2Wuju4&t=23s>

Kansas Basketball Player

<https://imagesvc.timeincapp.com/v3/fan/image?url=https://bustingbrackets.com/wp-content/uploads/getty-images/2017/08/466343706-iowa-state-v-kansas.jpg.jpg&>

Doctor Researching

<https://d2v9y0dukr6mq2.cloudfront.net/video/thumbnail/Vd3bj2jPe/medical-research-science-doctor-working-in-lab-woman-doctor-scientist-doing-research-medicine-medical-research-lab-lab-doctor-working-with-liquid-in-glass-flask-female-doctor-in-lab-medical_s7eb_sohtg_thumbnail-full05.png>

Penn State Football Practice

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jEz2w8_d6s4>

Lacrosse Practice

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oWpb-_lqYrs>

Wake Forest Soccer Practice

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_1KsTsobPZA>

Letter of Intent Signing

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_J93JcQMaJ4>

BHS Contract Signing

<http://www.berkeleyschools.net/four-bhs-student-athletes-participated-in-national-letter-of-intent-signing-day/>

NCAA Logo w/ Money

<https://www.nfldraftdiamonds.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/ncaaaa.jpg>

Baseball Video

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=J_LiAARtR7I>

Johnny Manzel Photo

<https://www.lockerroomtalk.com/blog/app/uploads/2015/07/johnny-manziel-threw-his-first-touchdown-pass-and-then-did-the-show-me-the-money-celebration.jpg>

Athlete Signing Autograph

[https://www.gannett-cdn.com/-mm-/379f78ff2dd497bae763f4557a1f9cb1cabaa7fa/c=1755-304-4890-2661&r=x408&c=540x405/local/-/media/USATODAY/None/2014/10/15/635489878414996351-c02-jump-26.jpg](https://www.gannett-cdn.com/-mm-/379f78ff2dd497bae763f4557a1f9cb1cabaa7fa/c%3D1755-304-4890-2661%26r%3Dx408%26c%3D540x405/local/-/media/USATODAY/None/2014/10/15/635489878414996351-c02-jump-26.jpg)

Students Walking on Campus

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ah5wN5CikC8>

Broke College Athlete Picture

<http://www.studentunionsports.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/Nigel-Hayes-2.jpg>

NCAA Logo on Basketball Court

<http://images.performgroup.com/di/library/sporting_news/b8/5c/ncaa-tournament-court-logo-033015-getty-ftrjpg_fvmn4ecemzai1v655j40yvbko.jpg?t=1803068532>

Official NCAA Building

<https://si.wsj.net/public/resources/images/BN-PY673_jenkin_J_20160923134510.jpg>

Graduation Clip

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CstYpNylWYg>

Athlete Studying

<http://www.uh.edu/powerhouse/_img/photo-scoring-high.jpg>

Saquon Barkley Touchdown

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Ctr2r3-q-bc>

Bucknell Women’s Water Polo

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TIPKC7h6D-o>

Maryland Football Team & Coach

<https://cdn-s3.si.com/s3fs-public/styles/marquee_large_2x/public/images/maryland-football-recruiting-under-armour-branding.jpg?itok=MGoWVjLG>

Ole Miss Stadium

<https://i.pinimg.com/originals/51/63/0d/51630d78318272109fabd9935f5281c4.jpg>

Ole Miss Football Game

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=S4aQI1jpPKU>

Time Magazine Cover

<https://b-i.forbesimg.com/tomvanriper/files/2013/09/TIME-Cover-College-Sports1-23.jpg>